

Seal the deal: An extensive study of European historical copper-based seal matrices using a multimodal protocol

M. Castelle, Philippe Dillmann, E. Vega, C. Blanc-Riehl, A. Vilain, Pierre

Chastang, E. Anheim

▶ To cite this version:

M. Castelle, Philippe Dillmann, E. Vega, C. Blanc-Riehl, A. Vilain, et al.. Seal the deal: An extensive study of European historical copper-based seal matrices using a multimodal protocol. Journal of Archaeological Science, 2020, 113, pp.105061. 10.1016/j.jas.2019.105061. cea-03087880

HAL Id: cea-03087880 https://cea.hal.science/cea-03087880

Submitted on 21 Jul2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

1 Seal the deal: an extensive study of European historical copper-

2 based seal matrices using a multimodal protocol.

3	M. Castelle ^{1,2*} , P. Dillmann ² , E. Vega ² , C. Blanc-Riehl ³ , A. Vilain ⁴ , P. Chastang ¹ , E. Anheim ⁵
4	¹ Dynamiques Patrimoniales et Culturelles, Université Versailles Saint Quentin en Yvelines - 47
5	boulevard Vauban, 78280 Guyancourt, France
6	² LAPA-IRAMAT, NIMBE, CEA, CNRS, Université Paris-Saclay, CEA Saclay 91191
7	Gif-sur-Yvette France
8	³ Centre d'accueil et de recherche des Archives nationales (CARAN) - 11 rue des Quatre-Fils,
9	75003 Paris, France
10	⁴ LARA, Laboratoire de recherche ARchéologie et Architecture / UMR 6566 CReAAH -
11	Chemin la Censive du Tertre 44312 Nantes, France
12	⁵ EHESS / CRH - 54, boulevard Raspail, 75006 Paris

13 Highlights

- 14 Overview of medieval and early modern European seal matrices technical practices
- 15 466 objects analysed by pXRF in order to document the alloys
- 16 Engraving techniques of 142 objects documented using binocular
- 17 6 cross sections of seal matrices examined under microscope
- 18 Crucial information provided on workshops diachronic tradition and specificities

19 Abstract

20 Seal matrices have been used in many civilizations across the globe for thousands of years. In Europe, 21 during the late medieval and early modern periods, they were made of a resistant material such as 22 metal, frequently copper-based alloys, and were an essential attachment of official documents, serving 23 as personal signatures. By investigating an exceptional body of objects, this work contributes to throw 24 some light on the technical landscape of copper-based seal matrix production which has remained 25 undocumented until now. A multi-modal approach was carried out in order to document the materials 26 and techniques involved. More than four hundred objects were analysed using a recently developed 27 portable XRF protocol for copper-based alloy analysis. In addition, more than one hundred were 28 carefully examined on a micro scale in order to determine the engraving techniques. Cross sections were obtained from six broken seal matrices, allowing the manufacturing process of the objects to be 29 30 revealed. First, although a wide range of copper-based alloys were documented, namely bronze, red 31 brass and brass, two groups of objects could be identified based on the Pb content, suggesting two

^{*} Corresponding author

^{© 2019} published by Elsevier. This manuscript is made available under the CC BY NC user license https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

- 32 levels of quality. Second, three different successive engraving techniques could be identified dating
- 33 from between the 13th c. and the 17th c: engraving, simple stamp combination and letter punches.
- 34 Finally, similarities in terms of the fabrication process and the alloys used in French and Italian ways
- 35 of production could suggest a transborder practice. Apart from providing insights into historical seal
- 36 matrices production, these results also contribute to the documentation of medieval and early modern
- 37 copper-based workshops practices.

38 Graphical Abstract



39

Keywords: Seal matrices; copper-based alloys; Medieval and Modern Periods; Western Europe;
Technical knowledge; pXRF; Metallographic study

42 **1. Introduction**

The context of production of small copper-based objects from Medieval and Early European Modern 43 44 periods remains largely undocumented despite some pioneer works addressing the technical 45 knowledge associated with copper-based domestic objects (Blades, 1995; Brinklow, 1975; Heyworth, 46 1991; White, 1982). Written sources provide crucial but yet incomplete information on organisation of 47 craftsmanship and processes (Boileau, 1879; Cennini and Herringham, 1922; Theophilus, 1979). From 48 an archaeological point of view, one can mention in particular the study of a Parisian copper-based 49 workshop excavated in the centre of the city (Bourgarit, 2012; Thomas, 2009; Thomas and Bourgarit, 50 2006). However, the deficit of data remains particularly persistent for European medieval and Early 51 Modern small size productions.

Among these productions, seal matrices were widely used by institutions and towns as well as a large portion of the population of high and intermediate status, from rich local farmer to royalty. The matrices, predominantly made of copper-based alloys, accompanied the *sigillant* throughout his life, as he carried it often on his belt, visible for everyone (Vilain, 2015). This work aims at gaining insight into the technical landscape of seal matrix production during the European Middle Ages and Early Modern periods. The objective is to provide an overview of the range of alloys employed for their fabrication, to reveal their context of production and associated technical knowledge, and to discuss their specificities in relations with the larger ensemble of small copper-based objects produced during this period.

61 Our study focuses his attention on the collections kept at the French National Archives (Archives 62 Nationales: AN) institution and at the Fine Arts Museum (Musée des Beaux Arts: MBA) of Lyon which constitute a unique group of objects from the 13th c. to the 17th c. The corpus under investigation 63 64 in this study is part of a large production representing probably several tens of thousands of objects, as 65 the number of objects kept in the collections, about ten thousands, only represents a small percentage 66 of the objects produced (Pastoureau, 2015). Thus, in order to identify trends and specificities within this large-scale production, it appears essential to characterize a sufficient number of objects in order 67 to get a representative view of the 13-17th c. seal matrix production. 68

69 To achieve this, and because of the large number of artefacts, portable X-ray fluorescence analyser 70 (pXRF) was used for systematic elemental analysis of the seal matrices alloys using a methodology 71 specifically developed for copper-based alloy and adapted to the very specific characteristics of the 72 collections under investigation (Heginbotham and Solé, 2017). It allowed a non-invasive in situ 73 analysis of the objects: an essential constraint when studying cultural heritage objects (Bonizzoni et 74 al., 2007; Bottaini et al., 2015; Colomban et al., 2012; Karydas, 2007; Šatović et al., 2013). Two main 75 problems must be addressed when analysing cultural heritage copper-based objects using pXRF 76 methods. First, due notably to their detection and quantification limits but also its associated 77 uncertainty, those techniques do not offer the analytical precision of, for example, ICP set ups. 78 Second, pXRF (and XRF in general) only probe a limited depth of the analysed object. This is 79 particularly important regarding analyses of Cu-alloys which are often covered with patina layers 80 (artificial or natural). Thus, it is necessary to carefully consider the depth probe according to both the 81 matrix and the patina layer composition / thickness. Having said that, pXRF, when rigorously 82 performed, allows the determination of the Cu-alloys main constituents with confidence. Indeed, 83 regarding the quality of provided quantitative data, progress has been made through the careful control 84 of data treatment and the development of a calibration procedure dedicated to copper-based alloys 85 (Heginbotham and Solé, 2017). Moreover, for relatively thin patinas, of a few microns, recent work by 86 different teams have allowed producing more trustworthy bulk metal composition data by giving a 87 reliable overview of both the applicability of the method (Karydas, 2007; Martinón-Torres et al., 88 2014) and bias of the analysis (Nørgaard, 2017; Orfanou and Rehren, 2015; Smith, 2012). This 89 provides several tracks for good pXRF data treatment and interpretation.

90 In addition, fabrication techniques were documented for the first time by metallographic approaches 91 and extensive observation of the engraving techniques including identification of tool marks. By 92 careful visual characterisation of the objects, insights into the different steps and the organisation of 93 the production were made possible.

94 **2. Materials and Method**

95 2.1. <u>Studied corpus</u>

In this work, a total 466 seal matrices (see example Figure 1) were investigated: 394 from the French 96 National Archives, 71 from the Fine Arts Museum of Lyon and one archaeological object (Table 1). 97 98 As French institutions were targeted, most of the objects have been collected in France where they 99 originate (79%) but 15% have been produced in Italy, and 6% from other European areas such as Holly Roman Empire or Spain. The chronological repartition of the corpus ranges from the 13th c. to 100 the 17th c. Objects from the 14th c. – a period of important production – are among the most numerous 101 (49% of the corpus), followed by objects from the 13th c. (18%) and 15th c. (17%). A few objects are 102 dated from intermediary periods (e.g. late 13th c - early 14th c.). Dating and provenance identification 103 are based on several stylistic criteria, helped by the inscriptions found on the objects themselves. Some 104 105 of the sigillants are well known and their seal matrices can thus be precisely dated according to their 106 assumption of duty for example. Those seal matrices constitute references for other dating. When in 107 doubt, the objects were not included in this study as the main objective was first to constitute a 108 reference database for this kind of metal production. The seal matrices measure typically a few 109 centimetres in diameter, and weight between a few tens of grams and two hundred grams. Almost all 110 the objects from the collections are in a very good state of conservation. Only a few of them have been 111 broken, most probably just after the death of the *sigillant* in order to avoid later use of the matrices to 112 produce false seals (Nieus, 2011; Vilain, 2016).



113

114Figure 1 : Seal matrix of the « Bailliage royal de Corbie », French National Archives, inv. Mat. 124, second half of 13th115century, France. H.: 13; D.: 46; th.: 4, Weight: 45.3g. © M Castelle LAPA/AN/DYPAC

	Period								
3M	13th c.	13th-14th c.	14th c.	14th-15th c.	15th c.	15th-16th c.	16th c.	16th-17th c.	17th c.
42 I	83/3	10/3	227 /48	11/10	79 / 35	1	38/8	7 /2	10/3
F/1	Origin								
pXR	France			Italy		Other			
166		372		68		26			
tal: 4	Collection								
To	French Nati	French National Archives Fine Arts M		Iuseum Lyon		INRAP			
		394 / 142		71		1			

116Table 1 : Overview of the seal matrices investigated for the present study. A total of 466 objects have been analysed by pXRF117/A total of 142 objects have been observed under binocular magnifier (BM). More details are to be found in supplementary118material.

119 2.2. *Fabrication process investigation*

Metallic cross sections were obtained from six already broken seal matrices by taking a sample of a few square millimetres by means of a diamond saw. These cross sections were prepared by mounting the samples in resin and then grinding and polishing the mount. Images were obtained using both optical microscope (OM) and Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) in order to not only question the seal matrices fabrication process but also estimate the chemical heterogeneity between the core metal and the surface areas – the patina – of the objects. Chemical ferric chloride etchant was used in order to reveal the microstructure under OM. In addition, 142 seal matrices were observed under a binocular microscope in order to characterise theengraving techniques. Both the inscriptions and the central motifs were carefully documented.

129 2.3. <u>Metal analyses (pXRF)</u>

130 466 seal matrices were selected to be analysed by portable-X-ray fluorescence (pXRF) with a Niton 131 XL3t spectrometer coupled with a 50 kV X-ray tube and a GOLDD Detector. These objects are 132 covered by a range of patina, from fine, almost visually inexistent, to medium, revealing the 133 underpinned metal. Seal matrices presenting a dark, powdery and inhomogeneous patina (approx. 10 134 % of the collections), or remains of gilding (only a few objects) were excluded, as only analyses of the 135 surfaces of the objects were possible.

Spectra acquisition were performed using a metal alloy mode including both light and main ranges of elements for a total counting time of 60 seconds and a 6 mm spot. Three measurements were taken at different places on the object in order to avoid possible heterogeneity issues of the materials. These measurements were averaged taking into account the associated standard deviation in order to appreciate the degree of homogeneity of the measurements. The consistency of the quality of each measurement was controlled by systematically analysing a set of four reference standards during the analyses carried out at the location of the collections.

143 Spectra were treated for quantification using the open-source, PyMca software (Solé et al., 2007) by 144 mean of the fundamental parameters (FP) approach based on the spectrometer characteristics allowing 145 total transparency during the process. Calibration was carried out based on the so-called CHARMed-146 PyMca protocol. This protocol is based on previous work showing not only good but also 147 reproductible results on pXRF analysis of Cu-alloys. The Cu-CHARM set of 12 reference materials 148 was used for calibration of the standard-less XRF measurements (Heginbotham et al., 2015). The 149 calibration coefficients were calculated for each considered element using standard reference values 150 both calculated (PyMca) and certified and through the MECS (Multi-Element Calibration 151 Spreadsheet) file proposed by these authors. The complete description of the calibration protocol has 152 been previously detailed (Heginbotham and Solé, 2017). Calibration curves obtained on four of the 153 main constituents (Cu, Sn, Zn, Pb) as well as on two minor components (Fe, Sb) of copper-based 154 alloys are presented in Figure 2. Calculated data are plotted together with certified values. Very good 155 calibrations are obtained for the considered elements. Only Pb exhibits a slightly less narrow 156 calibration. This is mainly due to the fact that Pb is not miscible into copper-based alloys and is 157 heterogeneously distributed within the matrix.



158

Figure 2 : Cu, Sn, Zn, Pb, Fe and Sb calibration plots using the CHARMed PyMca protocol (raw data are obtained using a
NITON GOLDD with an Ag tube). The 12 reference materials were analysed three times. The black line represents the linear
regression for each series of measurements, the grey lines represent the standard error at the prediction at 95% confidence
and R2 is the coefficient of determination of the linear regression.

163 The depth penetration of incident X-rays during the analysis has been calculated using linear 164 attenuation coefficients (Chantler et al., 2005; Markowicz, 2011) for several unpatinated copper-based 165 alloys. Corresponding data for CuZn15Sn6Pb2, CuZn15, Cu, CuSn10 and CuSn10Pb5 are reported in 166 Table 2. This made possible the control of the X-ray penetration for a good representativity of the 167 measurement, considering the presence of a thin patina layer.

		CuZn15Sn6Pb2		CuSn10		Cu		CuSn10Pb5		CuZn15	
X-ray lines	E	95% Xray	90% Xray	95% Xray	90% Xray	95% Xray	90% Xray	95% Xray	90% Xray	95% Xray	90% Xray
	KeV	μπ									
Sn-L	3.44	6	5	6	5			5	4		
Cu-K	8.91	57	44	55	42	92	71	44	34	65	50
Zn-K	9.57	18	14							87	67
Pb-L	12.61	31	24					34	26	17	13
Sn-K	25.27	205	157	196	151			158	121		

168Table 2 : Depth penetration of several X-ray lines according to four different types of copper-based alloys (μm). Provenance169depths are provided in μm for respectively 90% and 95% of the X-ray

170 **3. Results**

171 *3.1. <u>Seal matrices fabrication process</u>*

Micrographs of chemically etched cross sections taken from six seal matrices are presented in Figure 172 173 3. For five of them, observations under optical microscope after chemical etching revealed as-cast microstructures. No thermal treatment could be identified and only a few mechanical twins resulting 174 175 from a superficial mechanical treatment are observable, performed in order to prepare the surface to be engraved. As an exception, only one unalloyed copper seal matrix (Mat. 770) exhibits an annealed 176 177 microstructure attesting to a thermal treatment, which might have occurred just after a work hardening. 178 Such a process must have probably been reserved for some unalloyed copper objects – representing 179 only 2.6% of the objects analysed in the framework of this study (see below). Thus, it can be 180 confidently argued that all the alloyed copper objects of our corpus were manufactured by casting 181 process using refractory material moulds.



Figure 3 : Metallographic cross section of samples taken from six seal matrices, observation under optical microscope after
 etching of the surface with ferric chloride.

185 The central motifs of the observed seal matrices, from all periods, all show traces of direct engraving at the surface of the metal, with a few examples of punches from the 15th c. Had the motifs been 186 187 partially moulded, they were largely reworked afterwards. Yet, the hypothesis of direct engraving of 188 these motifs seems here convincing. The observation of the inscriptions on the other hand, reveals 189 three successive technical knowledges involved over the period considered (Figure 4 and Figure 5). Indeed, before the 14th c. the inscriptions were systematically achieved by direct engraving (Figure 4-190 191 A). Examples of the use of simple stamps combined to produce each letter could then be found (Figure 192 4-B). By the 16th c., letter-punches were more often employed (Figure 4-C) whereas engraved letters 193 tended to disappear.





195Figure 4 : Different techniques to realise the letters on the seal matrices: (A) engraving, (B) simple stamps combination, (C)196letter-punches



198Figure 5 : Chronological evolution of the seal matrices inscriptions techniques (142 objects distributed as follow, 13th c.:33;19913-14th c. :3; 14th c. 48; 14-15th c.:10; 15th c.: 35; 16th c.:8; 16-17th c.:2, 17th c.:3

201

3.2.1. Evaluation of the pXRF error due to the presence of patina

202 Patina layers of the six cross sections mentioned above seem to result from a natural mechanism of 203 alteration and have been formed by corrosion of the metal surface. They are composed by typical Cu-204 oxides and salts resulting from an indoor conservation of the objects (Nørgaard, 2017; Robbiola et al., 205 1998). These patina layers observed by means of SEM imaging on seal matrices cross section ranges 206 from a few microns to locally a few tens of microns. On the millimetric scale of the XRF spot, the 207 patina thickness mean values do not exceed 10-15 µm (Mat. 453 and Mat. 801) and are generally 208 about 6-7 µm (Mat. 770, Mat. 801, Mat 1190). No specific trends were observed regarding a possible 209 correlation between patina thickness and the age of the matrix, or alloy type.

210 The determination of differences in elemental composition between surface and metallic core was 211 undertaken by means of chemical EDS-SEM mapping of the cross sections. Additionally, 21 seal 212 matrices were unpatinated on a surface of a few mm² by means of polishing; pXRF analyses were 213 performed on both patinated and unpatinated areas. Results were compared in order to evaluate the 214 error induced by the presence of patina layers on main elements' quantitative data. The results of this 215 approach, combined with the SEM observations and analyses previously described, made it possible to 216 highlight that when in the presence of a natural patina formed at the seal matrix surface, Sn and Pb 217 contents tend to be overestimated as the patina results from a decuprification of the metallic surface 218 and the formation of superficial Pb and Sn enriched oxides. Moreover, when in presence of Zn, the 219 surface of the object typically suffers from a dezincification which results in underestimating the Zn 220 content. These phenomena must be taken into consideration when performing pXRF analysis at the 221 surface of the objects.

222 Thus, the comparison of data obtained on patinated and unpatinated areas shows that for a large 223 majority (75%) of the objects, the presence of patina generates an absolute error on quantitative data 224 inferior to +/- 3%. This value has little or no impact on the alloy identification (if it is a bronze, a brass 225 or a red brass, or does it contain Pb). The remaining cases (25%) fall into the statistical error of the 226 method and are compensated by the analysis of a large number of objects. With an associated error 227 between 3 and 7%, they do not affect the general distribution of the obtained data. Nevertheless, a 228 possible under (Zn) or over (Sn and Pb) estimation of the alloy's constituents described above should 229 be taken into account.



Figure 6 : Comparison of elements quantitative data obtained on both patinated and unpatinated area of seal matrices. A)
Pb, B) Zn, C) Sn. The numbers on the plots correspond to the inventory numbers AN. Mat. Absolute errors correspond to the difference between the composition measured on the unpatinated area and the composition measured on the patinated area.

234 *3.3. <u>Alloy rec</u>*

230

3.3. <u>Alloy recipes: a general overview</u>

235 The alloys nomenclatures defined by Bourgarit and Thomas (Bourgarit, 2012) and Bayley (Bayley, 236 1991) for medieval alloys were used as a starting point to define a new nomenclature adapted to the 237 alloys characterised in the framework of the present study. Bronze and brass alloys are defined by their 238 main alloying elements, respectively Sn and Zn. For Cu-Sn-Zn ternary alloys, as suggested by Bayley 239 (Bayley, 1991), subdivisions into Zn-rich and Sn-rich alloys were adopted. However, the term "red 240 brass" employed by Bourgarit and Thomas (Bourgarit, 2012) was preferred instead of "gunmetal" 241 which refers to the gun-making. Unalloyed copper might naturally contain low level of Zn and Sn, 242 hence the tolerance threshold including a few percent of these elements. This threshold is here based 243 on discontinuities in the data.

The nomenclature should be considered more as a description tool, a guide, than a clustering tool,
considering the continuum of the results and the constant overlapping of the categories which are
defined as follows:

- 247 Unalloyed copper: containing both less than 3 wt% Sn and 2 wt% Zn
- 248 *Bronze*: alloys with $Sn \ge 3Zn$ wt%.
- 249 Sn-rich red brass: alloys ranging between $Sn \ge 3Zn$ wt% and $2Sn \ge 3Zn$ wt%
- 250 *Red brass*: alloys ranging between $2Sn \ge 3Zn$ wt% and $2Zn \ge 3Sn$ wt%.
- 251 *Zn-rich red brass*: alloys ranging between $2Zn \ge 3Sn$ wt% and $Zn \ge 3Sn$ wt%.
- 252 *Brass*: alloys with a ratio $Zn \ge 3Sn$ wt%.
- Additional subdivision is made based on the Pb content of each alloy (e.g. leaded bronze): when 3 <

254 Pb < 6 wt%, the alloy is considered as "slightly leaded", below this limit, the alloy is "unleaded", and

when Pb > 6 wt%, it is considered as "leaded" (Bourgarit, 2012).

256 Major elements compositions of the matrix are plotted in Figure 7 in which these categories are 257 indicated by means of dashed lines. The compositions are distributed continuously from one type of 258 alloy to another. No specific group of objects can be derived solely from the alloying elements. 259 Despite this observation, in order to evaluate the distribution of the objects into this continuum, they 260 have been sorted out according to the nomenclature defined above (Figure 9). Thus, seal matrices from the corpus are spread as follow: brass (40 %), Zn-rich red brass (25 %), red brass (20%), Sn-rich red 261 brass (8%) and bronze (4.4%). A few unalloyed copper objects (2.5 %) were also characterized 262 263 (Figure 9). This distribution reflects a significant representation of Cu-alloys containing Zn. 264 Chronological and geographical specificities are discussed below.



Figure 7 : Scatter plot of Sn and Zn contents of the analysed seal matrices (wt %), the alloys types areas appear delimited by dashed lines.



Figure 8 : Kernel density plots representing the distribution of Pb, Sn and Zn contents according the alloys types brass,
 bronze and red brass. Density peaks or modes for each plot are expressed as percentages and provide information on where
 values are concentrated over the interval.





273

Figure 9 :Bar plots of the seal matrices distribution according to alloys types and Pb content. Data are expressed as percentage of the objects total.

277 Despite this apparent continuum, Pb content can be used as a criterion to distinguish three classes of 278 alloys despite the constant overlapping (Figure 8). First, objects made of unleaded Cu-alloys with no 279 or negligible quantities of Pb constitute a first group including a majority of the brass (54%) and 280 unalloyed copper (91%) objects, as well as 14% of the Zn-rich red brass objects. Second, objects made 281 of leaded copper-based alloys form a second group which encompasses a large majority of the bronze 282 (90%), Sn-rich red brass (85%), red brass (75%) and Zn-rich red brass (52%) objects. Finally, slightly 283 leaded copper-based alloys constitute an intermediary group including 27% of the brass objects, 33% of the Zn-rich objects, 16% of the red brass objects, and a few bronze, Sn-rich red brass objects, with 284 285 only one unalloyed coper object being slightly leaded.

287 **4. Discussion**

288 4.1. <u>Seal matrices fabrication</u>

As for the few Cu-alloyed objects for which the metallographic investigations were carried out, it is most likely that all the bronze, brass, Sn-rich red brass, red brass and Zn-rich red brass objects have been cast. Interestingly, Cennino Cennini 1437 treatise on arts offers a brief description of a possible process performed to take impression of either a seal or a coin (Cennini and Herringham, 1922, chap. 189), using a moulding material, made of ashes, salt and water:

294 "Then on this paste take impression of seals, medals, figurines, coins, or in general of anything of 295 which you desire impressions. This done, let the paste dry gradually without sun or fire. You may 296 pour on this paste the melted lead, silver, or any metal you please, for the paste is sufficiently 297 tenacious to bear a great weight."

This description actually refers to the first step of matrices fabrication process. This consists of casting a primary form, the semi-finished object, to be then decorated using engraving techniques. At this step of the process, some of the details of the central motifs might have been moulded, even if this remains difficult to confirm as traces of engraving were observed on all the central motifs of the objects. The mould, here described as a mixture of ashes, salt and water might also well have been in stone, metal or clay.

304 Thus, three distinct steps of the production process were most probably carried out to produce the final 305 object. The semi-finished matrix is first cast and prepared, including a light hammering of the surface 306 in order to obtain a perfectly regular and flat surface, as exemplified by the cross sections observed in 307 the framework of this study (Figure 4). The drawing composition is then set up and the central motif engraved or enhanced by engraving if pre-moulded. Finally, as exemplified by the two incomplete seal 308 309 matrices shown by Figure 10, the inscriptions, including most of the time the name of the owner, were 310 realized all around the edge. The question of the craftsmen in charge of the fabrication process is 311 beyond the scope of the present paper and will be discussed in a forthcoming publication.



314 Figure 10 : Incomplete seal matrices (Mat. 649 and Mat.763) revealing that the central motif is realised prior to the inscriptions.

316 *4.2. <u>Alloys technical specificities</u>*

313

We can say with confidence that none of the alloys encountered in our study would bring any difficulty during the fabrication process of the semi-finished product. Indeed, small size objects are relatively easy to cast regardless the nature of the copper-based alloy employed.

That said, the addition of Pb can reasonably be associated to a low level of alloy quality. Indeed, even if it reduces its fusion temperature, improves the castability of the metal when added in significant amount (from 10-15%) (Mille et al., 2010) and has the property to make the metal softer, this addition might have been decided upon for economic reasons rather than technical constraints. The addition of Pb could make the objects difficult to engrave as it is not miscible in the Cu-alloy and forms nodules at the grain boundaries, resulting in hardness heterogeneity in the metal. Furthermore, a metal too soft would also produce fuzzy engravings. This aspect will be explored in a forthcoming publication.

327 Conversely, the addition of Zn reduces the alloy porosity. Since fusion of Zn occurs at relatively low 328 temperature (420° C) compared to Cu(1085° C), Zn vapours escape from the molten metal, carrying

impurities and gas : the alloy obtained is purified and deprived from asperities (Campbell, 2015, p. 7).

330 Due to this Zn loss, it is impossible to estimate the initial Zn content before the fusion of the metal

takes place. This cleansing property of Zn is of particular interest when engraving as it provides a

homogeneous material, free from irregularities. This is even more noticeable if the alloy is deprived of Pb as it is the case for a large majority of brass objects in our study. However, Zn also has the property to form a barrier at the surface of the molten metal, therefore, when small crucible are used, the Zn loss is moderate (Gaffiero et al., 2011). Craftsmen might have found a good compromise between a clean metal, a sufficient amount of Zn remaining in the metal and production costs.

Although the type of alloy does not affect the semi-finished matrix fabrication, it induces variation of
colour and, by consequence, influence the general aspect of the objects. Indeed, brass alloys would
produce a bright goldish colour whereas bronze alloys a brown-grey one (Bourgarit, 2003).
Considering that the matrices were often openly carried by the *sigillant* as an ornamental accessory,
the colour would have most likely been of great importance.

342 *4.3. Particularities in question: typology, chronology, geography*

343 With regard to other small medieval artefacts, the wide range of alloys documented by the present 344 study demonstrates the absence of specificity related to the typology of the seal matrices. High and 345 late medieval small copper-based objects, including mounts, buttons, and other fittings items, 346 excavated at Leopoli-Cencelle, Italy (Gaudenzi Asinelli and Martinón-Torres, 2016), were made of 347 some of the alloys identified in our study, namely, on one hand, unleaded and leaded brass and Zn-rich 348 red brass, and, on the other hand, slightly leaded bronze, with only a few exception being made with 349 leaded brass and unleaded bronze. Therefore, in this case, slightly leaded bronze could be associated 350 with bell casting, an already established alloy specificity linked to the typology of the objects (Neri, 351 2018). This does not exclude the use of this alloy for other productions. The medieval dress 352 accessories analysed in the 90's (Heyworth, 1991) enables further questioning the correlation between 353 the composition of the alloy and the typology of the objects. For most of the objects analysed, 354 including similar objects as those found at Leopoli-Cencelle, compositions do not seem to be 355 correlated to the object categories: a wide range of copper-based alloys was documented, echoing the 356 results of the present study. In addition, if the material excavated in a late medieval Parisian workshop 357 (Bourgarit, 2012) had revealed some specificities of the alloys linked to the shaping techniques, and so 358 the typologies of objects, small cast objects constitute a coherent group, either made of low leaded red 359 brass or brass, two alloys encountered within the group of seal matrices.

The comparison between French and Italian seal matrices showed no regional specificities according to the metal composition (Figure 11). The same range of composition was documented for both French and Italian productions, suggesting a transborder practice which took advantage of the available copper-based alloys. This produces very interesting considerations in relation to workshop technical knowledge and attribution. Indeed, the nature of the alloy should not be used to support any argument on provenance of the object; however, it does provide a new vision of a common tradition developed in several European areas during Medieval an Early Modern times.

- 367 Regarding the chronology (Figure 12), similar alloy distributions were highlighted for the 13th and the
- 368 14th c., in the form of a continuum ranging from brass to bronze alloys. From the 15th c., bronze alloys
- 369 tended to be rare, with only a few exceptions, leading to a more important representation of Zn-
- 370 containing alloys, and in particular brass from the 16th c. onward. The ten matrices dated from the 17th
- 371 c., are all made of unleaded and slightly leaded Cu-Zn alloys, predominantly brass, with one matrix
- 372 being made of Zn-rich brass. That said, this later distribution should only be considered with caution
- 373 due the lower number of objects analysed from the 16^{th} and 17^{th} c.



Figure 11 : Sn, Zn and Pb contents (wt%) of the seal matrices from France (A) and Italy (B)





378 *4.4. Alloys types and production value*

Brass alloy compositions reveal a clear willingness to keep these alloys free of Pb, whose contents rarely exceed 6 wt% for 83% of the brass objects, with a very narrow 1.5 wt% mode (Figure 8). Such a specific selection of brass alloys with about 14 wt% Zn (Figure 8) could be linked to the constraint of valuable commissions requiring very specific aspects for the objects, and thus a very specific composition. In addition, this rather narrow composition could indicate that the metal was freshly prepared, as other authors have proposed (Gaudenzi Asinelli and Martinón-Torres, 2016).

385 Conversely, bronze alloys exhibit a wider range of Sn and Pb contents compared to Zn contents in 386 brass alloys (Figure 8). This suggests that bronze alloys were less strictly controlled than Cu-Zn 387 alloys. Several hypotheses can be built on this. First, bronze alloy compositions may vary between 388 several workshops according to the local technical tradition of foundry-men. Second, depending on 389 economical constraints, e.g. the budget of the customer, the alloy composition might have been 390 adapted in order to reduce de cost of the seal matrices, adding more or less Sn and Pb. Finally, bronze 391 alloys could originate from the recycling of various bronze objects in which Sn and Pb contents may 392 vary.

Regarding red brass alloys, whether rich in Zn or Sn, the hypothesis of recycling objects as raw materials seems particularly convincing given the wide range of composition encompassed by the group, from (0-30 wt% Pb, 3-15 wt% Sn, 3-15 wt% Zn). This could constitute an intermediary state resulting from the mixing of controlled brasses and random bronzes – sometimes leaded bronzes.

397 As all steps of seal matrix fabrication are identical whatever the alloy used, this latter can be 398 considered as the main factor in price variation, notwithstanding the relatively small size of the objects 399 and so the relatively small amount of materials required, as well as the possible low share of the 400 material costs compared with the cost of engraving. Despite the lack of sources documenting prices of 401 metals and alloys during the production period of the studied seal matrices, a few considerations help 402 the understanding of the relative price of one alloy type in respect to the others. First, as a result of the 403 cementation process, brass alloys were more expensive due to the very technical nature of their 404 production and involve complex technical knowledge (Bourgarit and Thomas, 2011; Pollard and 405 Heron, 2008, p. 20; Thomas and Bourgarit, 2018). Second, bronze alloys were relatively easily 406 produced and less expensive, despite the fact that Sn was probably more expensive than Cu. Finally, 407 leaded alloys, and especially leaded bronze, were among the cheapest Cu-alloys, as Pb was an 408 available resource and principally used to reduce the production cost of Cu-alloys. Consequently, seal 409 matrices with high Zn and low Pb contents constituted most in all probability the most expensive 410 objects. Interestingly, Etienne Boileau Livres des métiers (Boileau, 1879, pp. 79-80) talks about "bon 411 laton" in a sense of "good brass" that neither contains Pb or Fe and designates seal matrices and other 412 kind of buckles under the term "menue oevre", small objects made of Cu-alloys by foundry-men. But

this book does not specify why such an alloy should be considered as good, and what its composition was. Indeed, as far as Cu-Zn alloys are concerned, Zn ores naturally contain impurities that migrate together with Zn into the final Cu-metal (Bourgarit, 2012). As Pb can be one of those impurities, it is safe to assume that under a few percent, the presence of Pb, although well known by craftsmen based on the ore colour, as for Fe, could not have been intentional. Thus, brass alloys employed to cast seal matrices should be considered as "good brasses" whereas bronze and red brass objects, whether rich in Sn or Zn, might correspond to lower value productions in particular when leaded.

420 This question of alloys values during Medieval periods has been raised by the study of both everyday 421 objects such as cauldrons and more prestigious productions such as lecterns, candlesticks, aquamaniles 422 and (Dandridge, 2006; Thomas and Bourgarit, 2014). Brass alloys are reserved for the latter, whereas 423 bronze alloys possibly leaded, are used for the former. The economic criterion is perhaps one of the 424 most important issues in the choice of alloys. In this sense, the investigation of the remains of a late 425 medieval workshop excavated in Paris (Bourgarit, 2012) reveals another economic constraint probably 426 linked to the typology of the objects produced: the small cast artefacts are either made of brass or slightly leaded red brass (Sn-rich or Zn-rich red brass), whereas middle size castings are made of 427 428 leaded metals, either red brass, brass or copper. Thus, within the corpus of seal matrices, different 429 levels of quality of alloys are encountered. Unleaded alloys (mostly unleaded brass and Zn-rich red 430 brass) presenting a goldish aspect could have been used to cast more expensive copper-based objects. These objects might constitute an intermediary production, less expensive than silver objects. On the 431 432 contrary, leaded alloys (mostly leaded bronze, Sn-rich red brass and red brass) were most probably 433 cheaper. Finally, the question of objects made of unalloyed copper remains difficult to answer, 434 considering the poor representativity compared to the large number of studied seal matrices. Whether 435 these objects – soft, easy to corrode – were rare because of the colour and the properties of the alloy 436 remains unclear.

437 Therefore, despite the control by official instance operated over the production of seal matrices 438 (Vilain, 2015), it appears clear that some adjustments regarding the materials employed were made 439 possible. These adjustments were probably influenced by the wealth of the *sigillant*. This will be 440 further discussed in a forthcoming publication.

441 **5. Conclusion**

A large number (466) of Cu-based seal matrices from the French National Archives and the Fine Arts
Museum of Lyon was analysed during this study. This paper offers an extensive view of the technical
landscape of seal matrix production during European Middle Ages and Early Modern periods, from
the perspective of the materials and techniques involved.

446 The objects had made of a large range of unleaded and leaded Cu-based alloys including unalloyed 447 copper, bronze, brass and red brass, more or less rich in Sn and Zn, and their leaded counter parts. That said, looking at the Pb contents produces interesting considerations regarding the level of quality 448 449 of the matrices. Different levels could be identified within the body of objects. On one hand, unleaded 450 alloys (mostly brass) could have been used for high level quality productions. On the other hand, leaded alloys (mostly bronze but also Sn-rich red brass, red brass and Zn-rich red brass) could have 451 452 been reserved for a lower level quality production. Adjustments regarding the materials employed had 453 certainly been made according to the budget of the commissioner, local traditions of the production 454 workshop and availability of raw materials. As for the fabrication techniques, a multi-step process was 455 documented. In all probability, the Cu-alloyed semi-finished objects had all been cast. Central motifs 456 had then been engraved, and finally lettering had been placed all around. Within the investigated body 457 of objects, comparison between French and Italian productions made possible to document transborder practices, regarding both the materials employed and the fabrication techniques involved. With regard 458 to the chronology, similar ranges of alloys were documented for the period between the 13th and the 459 14th c. From the 15th c. to the 17th c., despite the lower number of objects investigated, alloys 460 461 containing Zn are well represented, whereas bronze alloys become progressively rare. In addition, for the earliest objects investigated, the legend was always engraved, letter by letter and the traces of 462 engraving tools are easily observable at high magnification. Starting from the 14th c. and becoming 463 more common through the 15th c., letters had been formed by combination of simple stamps 464 associated together to form each letter. Then, during the 16th c. it became more common to have letters 465 466 formed with letter-punches, one punch corresponding to one letter of the alphabet. This evolution of 467 practices not only implies a modification of technical knowledge, but also the development of new 468 tools within the workshops.

From a methodological point of view, this study confirms the potential of pXRF methods for the characterisation of copper-based alloys by implementing a rigorous calibration protocol of the device, and a careful control of the post-acquisition treatment. In addition, this work underlines the possible

- 472 bias of analyses carried out on altered objects, covered by a natural patina.
- 473

474

475 Acknowledgments

We wish to express our gratitude to François Planet who permitted the study a large number of seal matrices from the Fine Arts Museum of Lyon. We gratefully acknowledge Arlen Heginbottam (Conservator of Decorative Arts and Sculpture, J. Paul Getty Museum) and Thomas Calligaro (C2RMF) for their expertise and help regarding the pXRF data treatment. Warm thanks go to our

- 480 colleagues at the LAPA laboratory (IRAMAT), the French National Archives and the DYPAC
- 481 laboratory (UVSQ) for helping at different stages of this work. Finally, we would like to acknowledge482 the anonymous reviewers for their useful remarks.

483 **Competing interests**

484 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

485 Availability of data and materials

486 All experimental details can be available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

487 Funding

- 488 The authors wish to thank the Fondation des Sciences du Patrimoine (grant EUR-17-EURE-0021) for
- 489 funding the post-doctoral project in the frame of which this work was carried out.

490 **6. Bibliography**

- Bayley, J., 1991. Alloy nomenclature, in: Egan, G. and P., F. (Ed.), Medieval Finds from
 Excavations in London: 3. Dress Accessories c.1150-c.1450. HMSO, London, pp. 13–
 17.
- Blades, N.W., 1995. Copper alloys from english archaeological sites 400-1600 AD: ana
 anlytical study using ICP-AES. Royal Holloway University of London, London.
- Boileau, É. (1200?-12) A. du texte, 1879. Les métiers et corporations de la ville de Paris :
 XIIIe siècle. Le livre des métiers d'Étienne Boileau / publié par René de Lespinasse et François Bonnardot,...
- Bonizzoni, L., Galli, A., Poldi, G., Milazzo, M., 2007. In situ non-invasive EDXRF analysis
 to reconstruct stratigraphy and thickness of Renaissance pictorial multilayers. X-Ray
 Spectrom. 36, 55–61. https://doi.org/10.1002/xrs.930
- Bottaini, C., Mirão, J., Figuereido, M., Candeias, A., Brunetti, A., Schiavon, N., 2015. Energy 502 503 dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectroscopy/Monte Carlo simulation approach for the non-destructive analysis of corrosion patina-bearing alloys in archaeological bronzes: 504 The case of the bowl from the Fareleira 3 site (Vidigueira, South Portugal). 505 Spectrosc. 506 Spectrochim. Acta Part At. 103–104, 9–13. В 507 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2014.10.015
- Bourgarit, D., 2003. La couleur des alliages anciens à base de cuivre, in: Actes de l'Ecole
 Thématique Interdisciplinaire Sur La Couleur Des Matériaux : Les Métaux, 17-21
 Mars 2003, Association OKHRA, Roussillon, France, p. 17 p.
- Bourgarit, D., Thomas, N., 2012. Late medieval copper alloying pratices: a view from a
 Parisian workshop of the 14th century AD. J. Archaeol. Sci. 39, 3052–3070.
- Bourgarit, D., Thomas, N., 2011. The ancient brass cementation processes: from laboratory to
 field experiments. Hist. Metall. 20, 8–16.
- Brinklow, D.A., 1975. An examination of copper alloy metalworking in medieval York.
 University of Bradford, Bradford.
- 517 Campbell, J., 2015. Complete Casting Handbook: Metal Casting Processes, Metallurgy,
 518 Techniques and Design, 2nd ed. Butterworth-Heinemann, Amsterdam.
- Cennini, C., Herringham, C.J.P., 1922. The book of the art of Cennino Cennini: a
 contemporary practical treatise on quattrocento painting. London: George Allen &
 Unwin.
- 522 Chantler, C.T., Olsen, K., Dragoset, R.A., Chang, J., Kishore, A.R., Kotochigova, S.A.,
 523 Zucker, D.S., 2005. X-Ray Form Factor, Attenuation and Scattering Tables (version
 524 2.1). [WWW Document]. URL http://physics.nist.gov/ffast (accessed 12.5.18).
- Colomban, P., Tournié, A., Maucuer, M., Meynard, P., 2012. On-site Raman and XRF
 analysis of Japanese/Chinese bronze/brass patina the search for specific Raman
 signatures. J. Raman Spectrosc. 43, 799–808. https://doi.org/10.1002/jrs.3095
- Dandridge, P., 2006. Exquisite objects, prodigious technique. Aquamanilia, vessels of the
 Middle Ages, in: Barnet, P., Dandridge, P. (Eds.), Lions, Dragons, and Other Beasts:
 Aquamanilia of the Middle Ages, Vessels for Church and Table, Exh. Cat. New York
 and New Haven. Bard Graduate Center for Studies in the Decorative Arts, Design, and
 Culture in association with Yale University Press, New Haven and London, pp. 35–56.
- Gaffiero, A., Téreygeol, F., Suspène, A., Gratuze, B., Zeller, S., 2011. La production
 monétaire romaine en orichalque: caractérisation du monnayage et approche du
 processus d'élaboration par l'expérimentation. Archéosciences 35, 93–102.
- Gaudenzi Asinelli, M., Martinón-Torres, M., 2016. Copper-alloy use in a Tyrrhenian
 medieval town: The case of Leopoli-Cencelle (Italy). J. Archaeol. Sci. Rep. 7, 597–
 608. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jasrep.2015.09.023

- Heginbotham, A., Bassett, J., Bourgarit, D., Eveleigh, C., Glinsman, L., Hook, D., Smith, D.,
 Speakman, R.J., Shugar, A., Van Langh, R., 2015. The Copper CHARM Set: A New
 Set of Certified Reference Materials for the Standardization of Quantitative X-Ray
 Fluorescence Analysis of Heritage Copper Alloys*: The Copper CHARM Set.
 Archaeometry 57, 856–868. https://doi.org/10.1111/arcm.12117
- Heginbotham, A., Solé, V.A., 2017. CHARMed PyMca, Part I: A Protocol for Improved
 Inter-laboratory Reproducibility in the Quantitative ED-XRF Analysis of Copper
 Alloys. Archaeometry n/a-n/a. https://doi.org/10.1111/arcm.12282
- Heyworth, M., 1991. Metallurgical analysis of the dress accessories, in: Dress Accessories c.
 1150-c. 1450. London.
- Karydas, A.G., 2007. Application of a Portable XRF Spectrometer for the Non-Invasive
 analysis of Museum Metal Artefacts. Ann. Chim. 97, 419–432.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/adic.200790028
- Markowicz, A., 2011. An overview of quantification methods in energy-dispersive X-ray
 fluorescence analysis. Pramana 76, 321–329. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12043-011 0045-z
- Martinón-Torres, M., Li, X.J., Bevan, A., Xia, Y., Zhao, K., Rehren, T., 2014. Forty
 Thousand Arms for a Single Emperor: From Chemical Data to the Labor Organization
 Behind the Bronze Arrows of the Terracotta Army. J. Archaeol. Method Theory 21,
 534–562. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10816-012-9158-z
- Mille, B., Piccardo, P., Amendola, R., Adobati, A., 2010. High lead in copper alloys: why
 does it help casting? Presented at the 3rd Internationalo Conference on
 Arhaeometallurgy in Europe, 29th June-1st July 2011.
- Neri, E., 2018. La place des cloches dans les productions en alliages cuivreux : spécificités
 techniques à travers les vestiges archéologiques d'ateliers italiens, in: Medieval
 Copper; Bronze and Brass. Agence wallonne du Patrimoine, Namur, pp. 227–238.
- Nieus, J.-F., 2011. L'hérédité des matrices de sceaux princiers au XIIe siècle, entre conscience lignagère et discours politique, in: Pourquoi Les Sceaux? La Sigilographie
 Nouvel Enjeux. Villeneuve d'Ascq, pp. 217–240.
- Nørgaard, H.W., 2017. Portable XRF on Prehistoric Bronze Artefacts: Limitations and Use
 for the Detection of Bronze Age Metal Workshops. Open Archaeol. 3, 101–122.
 https://doi.org/10.1515/opar-2017-0006
- 571 Orfanou, V., Rehren, T., 2015. A (not so) dangerous method: pXRF vs. EPMA-WDS
 572 analyses of copper-based artefacts. Archaeol. Anthropol. Sci. 7, 387–397.
 573 https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-014-0198-z
- Pastoureau, M., 2015. Préface, in: Matrices de Sceaux Du Moyen Âge, Monnaies, Médailles
 et Antiques. Éditions de la Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris, pp. 9–11.
- 576Pollard,A.M.,Heron,C.,2008.ArchaeologicalChemistry.577https://doi.org/10.1039/9781847558299<
- Robbiola, L., Blengino, J.-M., Fiaud, C., 1998. Morphology and mechanisms of formation of
 natural patinas on archaeological Cu–Sn alloys. Corros. Sci. 40, 2083–2111.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0010-938X(98)00096-1
- Šatović, D., Desnica, V., Fazinić, S., 2013. Use of portable X-ray fluorescence instrument for
 bulk alloy analysis on low corroded indoor bronzes. Spectrochim. Acta Part B At.
 Spectrosc. 89, 7–13. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2013.08.007
- Smith, D., 2012. Handheld X-ray fluorescence analysis of Renaissance bronzes, in: Handheld
 XRF for Art and Archaeology. Leuven University Press, pp. 37–74.
- Solé, V.A., Papillon, E., Cotte, M., Walter, Ph., Susini, J., 2007. A multiplatform code for the
 analysis of energy-dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectra. Spectrochim. Acta Part B
 At. Spectrosc. 62, 63–68. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2006.12.002

- Theophilus, 1979. On divers arts. Translated by J.G. Hawthorne and CS Smith. Dover
 Publications inc, New York.
- 591 Thomas, N., 2009. Les ateliers urbains de travail du cuivre et de ses alliages au bas Moyen
 592 Âge : Archéologie et histoire d'un site parisien du XIVe siècle dans la Villeneuve du
 593 Temple (1325-1350). Paris 1, Paris.
- Thomas, N., Bourgarit, D., 2018. La peine emporte-t-elle le profit ? Économie de la production du laiton par cémentation au Moyen Âge, in: Thomas, N., Dandridge, P. (Eds.), Proceedings of the Symposium of Dinant and Namur, 15-17 May 2014. Institut du patrimoine wallon (Études et documents, Archéologie), Namur, pp. 71–88.
- Thomas, N., Bourgarit, D., 2014. Les techniques de production des batteurs et fondeurs mosans au Moyen Age (XIIe-XVIè siècles), in: Thomas, N., Leroy, I., Plumier, J. (Ed.), L'or Des Dinandiers - Fondeurs et Batteurs Mosans Au Moyen Age. Maison du patrimoine médiéval mosan, Bouvignes - Dinant, pp. 43–64.
- Thomas, N., Bourgarit, D., 2006. Une industrie médiévale du Bronze. La Recherche 403, 56–
 58.
- Vilain, A., 2016. Le devenir post-mortem des sceaux médiévaux : le cas des matrices brisées
 normandes, in: Maneuvrier, C., Chassel, J.-L., Blanc-Riehl, C. (Eds.), Colloque
 International de Cerisy-La-Salle (4-8 Juin 2013), Apposer Sa Marque : Le Sceau et
 Son Usage (Autour de l'espace Anglo-Normand). Léopard d'Or, Paris.
- Vilain, A., 2015. Matrices de sceaux du Moyen Âge. Éditions de la Bibliothèque nationale de
 France.
- 610 White, R., 1982. Non-ferrous metalworking from Flaxengate, Lincoln, from the 9th-11th 611 centuries. Institut of Archaeology, London.
- 612