

Silver and thallium historical trends in the Seine River basin

Sophie Ayrault, Cindy Rianti Priadi, O. Evrard, Irène Lefevre, Philippe Bonté

► To cite this version:

Sophie Ayrault, Cindy Rianti Priadi, O. Evrard, Irène Lefevre, Philippe Bonté. Silver and thallium historical trends in the Seine River basin. Journal of Environmental Monitoring, 2010, 12 (11), pp.2177. 10.1039/C0EM00153H. cea-02615667

HAL Id: cea-02615667 https://cea.hal.science/cea-02615667

Submitted on 23 May 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

 Sophie Ayrault ^{1,*}, Cindy Rianti Priadi ¹, Olivier Evrard ¹, I Bonté¹ ¹ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (L (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France 	Olivier Evrard ¹ , Irène Lefèvre ¹ , Philippe
 Sophie Ayrault ^{1,*}, Cindy Rianti Priadi ¹, Olivier Evrard ¹, I Bonté¹ ¹ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (L (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France 	Olivier Evrard ¹ , Irène Lefèvre ¹ , Philippe
 4 Bonté¹ 5 6 ¹ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (L 7 (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France 	
 5 6 ¹ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (L 7 (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France 	
 ¹ Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (L (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France 	
7 (CEA/CNRS/UVSQ), Gif-sur-Yvette, France	l'Environnement (LSCE/IPSL), UMR 1572
	ce
8	
9 Corresponding author:	
10 Sophie Ayrault	
11 Laboratoire LSCE	
12 Domaine du CNRS	
13Avenue de la Terrasse, bat 12	
14 91198 Gif-sur-Yvette, France	
15 Tel : 33 (0) 1 69 82 43 54	
16 E-mail : sophie.ayrault@lsce.ipsl.fr	
17	
18	

19 Abstract

20 Records on pollution by metals of minor economic importance (e.g. silver, thallium) but 21 which prove to be toxic are rarely documented in river sediment. This study used two 22 sediment cores collected downstream of the Seine River to describe the temporal evolution of Ag and Tl concentrations in an urban catchment. Radionuclide analysis (i.e. Cs-137 and Pb-23 24 210) allowed dating sediment deposition within the cores (1933-2003). Ag concentration reached maximum values of $14.3 - 24.6 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$ in the 1960s and 1970s, before gradually 25 decreasing up to values which approximated 4 mg kg⁻¹ in 2003. In contrast, Tl concentrations 26 remained roughly constant throughout the core (median value of 0.86 mg kg⁻¹). Suspended 27 28 solids was collected at upstream locations in the catchment to derive the background concentrations in Ag and Tl. Very high Ag concentrations were measured in the upstream 29 Seine River sites $(0.33 - 0.59 \text{ mg kg}^{-1})$, compared to the values reported in the literature 30 (0.055 mg kg⁻¹). This suggests the presence of a widespread and ancient Ag pollution in the 31 Seine River basin, as demonstrated by the very high Ag enrichment ratios recorded in the 32 cores. Annual flux of particulate Ag in the Seine River was estimated at 1.7 t yr⁻¹ in 2003. In 33

34 contrast, Tl concentrations remained in the same order of magnitude as the natural 35 background signal $(0.3 - 0.5 \text{ mg kg}^{-1})$. This study suggests that the Seine River basin is free of 36 Tl contamination. Future concerns should hence mostly rely on Ag contamination, in a 37 context of increasing Ag uses and possible releases to the environment.

38

40 Introduction

The presence of metals in the environment is known to be harmful and dangerous for fauna, biota and even for human health ^{1,2}. So far, research effort has focused on the behaviour of economically important trace metals (Cr, Hg, Ni, Pb, Zn). Nevertheless, other metals such as silver (Ag) and thallium (Tl) are also particularly toxic. Silver and thallium were assigned to the highest toxicity class, together with cadmium and mercury. Still, the environmental impacts of Ag and Tl anthropogenic emissions are poorly documented, which is probably due to their low abundance in the environment.

Whereas silver and thallium are rather scarce in the crust (0.08 mg kg⁻¹ for silver and 48 $0.1 - 1.7 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$ for thallium ³), they can concentrate in sediment and bio-accumulate in 49 organisms (e.g. in benthic invertebrates)⁴. Silver has been used by people and extracted from 50 51 argentiferous lead ores since ancient times. People first considered it as a precious metal and 52 used it to make currency coins and jewellery. Its use has now greatly diversified and Ag is found in photographic films, electrical devices, batteries, brazing alloys and electroplating, 53 coins and metals⁵. In 1995, photographic manufacturing represented 50% of the U.S. silver 54 demand, whereas electrical contacts and conductors only accounted for 15% of the total 55 56 demand. With the fast development of digital photography, silver applications in this domain sharply decreased (from 26 % in 1999 to 12.5 % in 2008 ⁶), whereas silver use in electronic 57 components greatly increased. Overall, the annual world demand in Ag increased 58 significantly, from 13500 t yr⁻¹ in 1995 ⁷ to 24500 t yr⁻¹ in 2005 ⁸. These authors estimated the 59 global emissions of silver to the environment at 13420 t yr⁻¹, from which ca. 457 t yr⁻¹ were 60 61 dissipated to water between 1997-2000.

62 Contrary to Ag, thallium was only discovered in 1861 and it mainly served as a rat 63 killer in the past. However, Tl has not been as widely used as Ag. It is for instance used to 64 make thermometers and photocells, and 60% of thallium is used by the US electronics

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

65 industry. TI world production reached only 30 t yr⁻¹ in 1984⁷. Because of the volatile nature 66 of TI compounds, TI is readily emitted to the atmosphere by coal combustion, cement 67 production, metal smelting and refining, as well as waste incineration ⁹. Furthermore, half of 68 the environmental emission is released to water, as reported in the US Environmental 69 Protection Agency consumer factsheet devoted to thallium in drinking water and its impacts 70 on public health (see

71 http://www.epa.gov/ogwdw000/contaminants/dw_contamfs/thallium.html).

The historical evolution of Ag and Tl atmospheric concentrations was documented by several studies carried out in the northern hemisphere. Analyses were carried out on snow and ice samples collected at the Mont Blanc ¹⁰; ombrotrophic peat bog samples from Switzerland ¹¹; sediment cores from boreal and remote, Swedish lakes ¹²; and Artic snow and ice cores ¹³. These studies indicate a regional and long-range contamination of ecosystems by atmospheric deposition for both Ag and Tl.

78 In the case of the Swedish boreal and remote lakes, a contribution from the catchment geological background to the Ag concentration was not excluded ¹². The authors concluded to 79 80 an Ag contamination of the recent sediment due to the atmospheric deposition that occurred 81 after the Second World War. Furthermore, analyses of snow and ice collected at the French Alps indicate an increase in Ag atmospheric deposition after 1950¹⁰. This increase is related 82 83 to the increase in Ag production extracted from argentiferous lead ores. In Artic snow and ice 84 cores, a huge Ag peak was observed around 1960 and associated it with the economic boom that occurred after the Second World War¹³. A huge Ag peak dating from 1967 was also 85 registered in ombrotrophic peat bog samples from Switzerland¹¹. Even though Ag 86 concentration has continuously increased since the beginning of last century, the average 87 88 concentration found in samples of Arctic snow and ice in recent times are in the same order of

89 magnitude of the enrichments already observed during the Medieval, Roman and90 Greek/Phoenician periods.

91 Data on Tl historical trends are even scarcer than for Ag, and the conclusions are somewhat different from one study to another. Tl concentrations have been increasing since 92 93 the mid-1800s, but the most prominent increase took place after the Second World War, as it is recorded in lake sediment cores ¹². This increase is consistent with the 1967 peak observed 94 in peat bogs ¹¹. The highest Tl concentrations were observed for the years 1870 and 1920 in 95 Artic ice core ¹³ but a similar peak as the one observed for Ag concentrations in the 1960s was 96 97 not identified for Tl. Ag and Tl experienced hence different historical evolutions. A decrease 98 in both Ag and Tl concentrations was nevertheless observed during the last decade.

99 Overall, the former studies observed the occurrence of a significant Ag and Tl 100 contamination in the environment after the Second World War, and they related it to the 101 industrialisation of Europe. Ag contamination was observed in ancient archives (8000-300 102 BP). A decrease in Ag and Tl environmental concentrations was only detected during the last 103 decade in archives exhibiting the highest temporal resolution (i.e. ice cores). These studies 104 suggest that Ag and Tl release to the environment are controlled by independent sources 105 and/or processes.

The availability of techniques to detect Tl at very low concentrations is recent ¹⁴. Data on Tl concentrations in lakes are rather alarming (e.g. at the Great Lakes ¹⁵). However, similar data are scarce for rivers. Still, obtaining information on the historical evolution of Tl and Ag concentrations in urban catchments is crucial, given river water is used as a supply source for human consumption in densely urbanised areas. Furthermore, the secondary mobilisation of heavy metals from overbank sediment has been demonstrated ¹⁶.

Ag is found to be mostly bound to sulphides and organic matter. It is strongly sorbed to suspended particles. In river systems, it is rapidly incorporated into sediment and most of

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

the dissolved silver (<0.45µm filtration) is associated with colloids ¹⁷. This high affinity for 114 115 suspended matter would explain why 90 % of Ag are found in the solid phase once they reach the estuary because of dissolved Ag scavenging by organic matter ¹⁸. In this context, analysis 116 of sediment cores sampled in river floodplains can offer a solution to determine the 117 118 concentrations in this metal. With respect to Tl, the partitioning between the dissolved and solid phases remains the subject of lively debate ¹⁹. Nevertheless, it seems reasonable to 119 120 hypothesise that the occurrence of a severe pollution in Tl would be recorded in sediment 121 despite the dominance of the dissolved fraction. We propose hence to analyse two sediment 122 cores collected in the Seine River basin, which is one of the most polluted areas in the world in terms of metal contamination 20,21 . 123

124 This study aims to derive the historical trends of Ag and Tl contamination in the Seine 125 River basin. Ag and Tl concentrations in sediment will be compared to the natural 126 geochemical background concentrations. Sediment samples collected at upstream sites 127 considered as only slightly impacted by human activities will be analysed to define the local 128 geochemical background level. Scandium (Sc) will be used as a reference element, because of its conservative behaviour, to evaluate the anthropogenic impact of Ag and Tl on river 129 contamination ^{11,13}. Finally, the main sources of Ag and Tl delivery to the river will also be 130 131 outlined.

132

133 **Experimental**

134 Study area and selection of the coring sites

Two cores were collected in the Seine River floodplain, about 100 km downstream of Paris and its main waste waster treatment plant (Seine – Aval waste water treatment plant at Achères). The sampling sites drain 96% of the Seine River basin and are located within the last major meander of the Seine River before it reaches its estuary.

139	The first site (i.e. Bouafles) is located just upstream of a dam, in 'Les Andelys' (Fig.
140	1), in an oxbow lake located on the right bank of the Seine River. It corresponds to a recent
141	accretion area as indicated by the recent burial of trees. This undisturbed sampling area has
142	remained under grassland for 30 years, and gradual sediment deposition has occurred. Local
143	inhabitants confirmed indeed that the site has been flooded at least once each year until 2004.
144	The analysis of eleven cores collected in the area between 2003-2008 demonstrated that they
145	correspond to the sedimentation that occurred during the last 60 years (see ²¹ for details).
146	The second site (i.e. Muids) is located in the same meander and on the same bank of
147	the Seine River, but 12 km further on downstream. This site is composed by four islands
148	which experienced regular flooding during winter.
149	
150	Core sampling
151	Three cores were sampled in each site on April 9, 2003 using an Eijkelkamp device
152	equipped with a percussion drill bit (with 10-cm diameter and 1-m length). The soil corer
153	could be opened laterally, which allowed an immediate transfer of the core into a PVC tube to
154	prevent its contamination by metals.
155	
156	Core dating
157	Dating of the sediment cores relied on the measurement of two radionuclides (i.e. Cs-
158	137 and Pb-210) that strongly sorb to fine sediment ^{22,23} . Cs-137 was used as an event-tracer,
159	whereas Pb-210 provided the sediment age.
160	Both radionuclides are gamma emitters and they can be detected in small quantities of
161	soil (ca. 50-100 g, typically) without any previous chemical treatment. Sediment was dried at
162	115°C, sieved (< 2 mm), ground to a fine powder and placed in air-tight counting boxes.
163	Counting was conducted during ca. 10^5 s using Germanium gamma-ray detectors

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

164 (Germanium hyperpure – GeHP, N-type, coaxial model) available at the *Laboratoire des* 165 Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement (Gif-sur-Yvette, France). Efficiencies and 166 background of the detectors were periodically controlled with internal soil and sediment 167 standards, pure KCl samples, and IAEA standards (i.e. Soil-6, -135 and –375). Activity decay 168 was corrected taking account of the sediment collection period.

169 Cs-137 is an artificial radionuclide ($t_{1/2} = 30$ years) produced by the thermonuclear 170 bomb testing conducted between the 1950s and the 1980s (with a maximum input in 1964) 171 and the Chernobyl accident in 1986. Measurement of Cs-137 activity in sediment allowed 172 determining the location of three events: the fallout due to the first significant input in the 173 atmosphere in 1954, the maximum input in 1964 and the fallout due to the Chernobyl catastrophe in 1986. Cs-137 is now stored in soils, and this Cs-137 stock decreases by 174 175 radioactive decay and by fine sediment transfer to the rivers. Cs-137 is easily identified in 176 gamma spectrometry by a peak at 661 keV. Uncertainty on measurements was ca. 0.5%, and the detection limits reached 0.3 Bq kg⁻¹. 177

178 Pb-210 is a natural radionuclide ($t_{1/2} = 22.3$ years) which is a decay product of U-238 $(t_{1/2} = 4.5 \ 10^9 \text{ years})$. U-238 decays through a series of short-lived nuclides (e.g. Ra-226, Rn-179 180 222). Rn-222 is a gas that partly remains *in situ*, forming "supported" Pb-210, and that partly 181 escapes to the atmosphere, forming "excess" Pb-210, which reaches the soil surface by wet 182 and dry fallout. It then strongly sorbs to soil particles. The activity in "excess" Pb-210 was calculated by subtracting the supported activity (determined using a U-238 daughter, i.e. Bi-183 214) from the total activity of Pb-210²⁴. Uncertainty on measurements was thus higher than 184 185 for Cs-137 (ca. 10%).

186

187 Suspended matter sampling

188 In order to determine the background values for Ag and Tl in the river, suspended 189 matter (SM) was collected in the Seine and Marne rivers at upstream locations (i.e. at 190 Marnay-sur-Seine and Méry-sur-Marne; Fig. 1a). At Méry-sur-Marne, water was collected on 191 two field campaigns (April 2006 and January 2007) by grab sampling with PVC buckets from 192 the river bank. Twenty-liter samples were stored in PVC jerrycans thoroughly rinsed with 193 alkaline detergent TFD-4[®]. SM was obtained by gravitational settling of the samples during 194 several days. Uplying water was eliminated and approximately two litres of water were 195 centrifuged at 3000 rpm. Finally, recovered SM was freeze-dried. At Marnay-sur-Seine, SM 196 was collected in sediment traps from December 2008 to February 2009. These traps consisted in 1.5-liter PET water bottles²⁵. They were emptied once a month, providing SM data at a 197 198 monthly time step. Samples were collected in polyethylene bottles thoroughly rinsed with 1 M 199 HNO₃ for several days. Samples were then centrifuged at 14000 rpm and vacuum-dried.

200

201 Elemental analysis.

202 Sc and Ag concentrations were measured using INAA (Instrumental Neutron 203 Activation Analysis) analyses conducted on bulk sediment powder. Fifty-mg samples were irradiated during 30 minutes by a flux of 2.3 10^{13} neutrons cm⁻² s⁻¹ in the experimental reactor 204 205 Orphée (Commissariat à l'Energie Atomique, Saclay, France), using the irradiation facilities 206 of the *Laboratoire Pierre Süe*. Four successive gamma spectrometry measurements were then 207 conducted using Germanium gamma-ray detectors (Germanium hyperpure - GeHP, N-type, 208 coaxial model). Ag and Sc concentrations were determined using the 10-h counting after a 30 209 days-decay.

Ag and Tl concentrations were measured using ICP-MS (Inductively Coupled Plasma - Mass Spectrometry) on totally digested samples. One hundred mg-samples were totally dissolved by successive additions of HNO₃ and HCl mixture, HF, and HClO₄ in Teflon

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

213 vessels using a heating block (Digiprep, SCP Science). Ultra pure reagents were used (Normatom grade, VWR, France for HNO₃, and HCl, "for trace metal analyses", Baker, 214 215 SODIPRO, France, for HF, and HClO₄). The solutions were evaporated to dryness, retaken 3 times in 2 ml of HNO₃ and then diluted with 50 mL of MilliO water. The concentrations were 216 217 determined by Inductively Coupled Plasma – Quadrupolar Mass Spectrometry ICP-QMS (X 218 Series, ThermoElectron, France). To correct for instrumental drifts and plasma fluctuations, 219 all solutions were spiked with rhodium (Rh) and rhenium (Re) standard solutions (SPEX, SCP Science, France) to a final concentration of 10 μ g L⁻¹ for Rh and 1 μ g L⁻¹ for Re. The 220 221 solutions were weighted at each step of the dilution and spiking operations.

We only provide the Ag ICP-MS results for the suspended sediment collected at 222 223 Méry-sur-Marne and Marnay-sur-Seine, because this technique offers lower detection limits 224 than INAA (Table 1). The combined errors of the concentration measurements (Ag INAA, Sc 225 INAA, Ag and Tl ICP-MS) were estimated to be in the order of 10%, 8% and 5%, respectively. The accuracy of the analytical data was checked by analysing the GXR-1 226 227 reference material (jasperoid, USGS) by both methods. The measured concentrations in 228 GXR-1 agreed with the recommended Ag and Sc concentration values, and with the Tl 229 provisional concentration value (Table 1).

The enrichment factors (EF) in both Ag and Tl were calculated based on the methodology developed by Wedepolhl²⁶ (Eq. 1).

$$EF = ([M]/[Sc])_{Sample} / ([M]/[Sc])_{Natural background} (1)$$

where *M* represents Ag or Tl and using the natural background values of Ag/Sc (0.08) and Tl/Sc $(0.10)^{26}$.

235

236 **Results and discussion**

237 **Dating of sediment cores**

- The cores (i.e. B2 for the Bouafles site and M1 for the Muids site) used in this study were selected because of their reliable record of sedimentation.
- The depth profile of Cs-137 in the B2-core is shown in Fig. 2a. The events corresponding to the 1986 and 1964 fallout were clearly recorded. In depth, no Cs-137 was detected anymore, indicating that the core includes sediment deposited before 1954. Sedimentation rate derived from the excess Pb-210 profile appeared to be constant throughout the core, and the sedimentation rate derived from the chronology of the core reached 1.8 cm yr^{-1} .

With respect to the M1-core, sedimentation rates appeared to have varied throughout time (Fig. 2b). Chernobyl fallout is located at 14-cm depth, whereas the maximum Cs-fallout that occurred in 1964 is located at 43-cm depth (Fig. 2c). Calculated sedimentation rates sharply decreased throughout time, from 2.5 cm yr⁻¹ before 1964, to 1.3 cm yr⁻¹ between 1964 and 1986, and only 0.8 cm yr⁻¹ between 1986 and 2003. This gradual decrease in sedimentation was due to the progressive burial of the river bed by suspended matter deposition at this location.

253

254 Ag and Tl concentrations at upstream sites of the Seine River basin

Mean concentrations in Ag measured in the sediment collected at Marnay-sur-Seine ($0.33 \pm 0.15 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$) and at Méry-sur-Marne ($0.59 \pm 0.01 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$) are about tenfold higher than the Ag upper continental crust background values (0.055 mg kg^{-1}) (Table 2) ^{3,26}.

Three explanations can be put forward to explain this difference. First, the high Ag concentrations measured in the Seine River could indicate that the geochemical background values are exceptionally high in this river. However, we rule out this hypothesis, because of the dominant sedimentary origin of the rocks in the Seine River basin. Second, they could indicate that the Seine River basin underwent a general and very ancient pollution. This

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

second hypothesis seems more likely. Such a large contamination by atmospheric deposition has also been observed in remote environmental archives ¹³. Third, this contamination could be explained by Ag released by lead (Pb) industries present in the Upper Seine and the Marne catchments. Pb and Ag are indeed strongly associated in Pb-ores. Even though the activity of lead industrial facilities strongly decreased after 1970 in the Seine River basin ²⁷, there are still a dozen plants in activity in the Upper Seine and the Marne catchments (Fig. 1b) ²⁸.

Overall, data are still too scarce to draw conclusions about the high Ag geochemical background signal in the Seine River basin. Sediment deposited before the protoindustrialisation in the region needs to be collected and analysed to derive this signal.

In contrast, thallium concentrations measured at Marnay-sur-Seine (0.30 mg kg^1) and 272 273 Méry-sur-Marne (0.45 mg kg⁻¹) (Table 2) are in good agreement with the median Tl concentration in European floodplain sediment ²⁹. They were even lower than the Tl 274 275 geochemical background concentrations reported in the upper continental crust (0.75 mg kg⁻ 276 ¹). The low Tl concentrations that we observed could be explained by the dilution of the 277 geological Tl input by autochthonous calcite and/or organic matter. Scandium (Sc) 278 concentrations were measured in all the samples. Normalising Tl concentrations to Sc allows 279 taking account of this dilution effect. The Tl/Sc ratio for the reference geochemical 280 background varies between 0.068 and 0.107. According to our data, the Tl/Sc ratio reached 281 0.046 ± 0.005 at Marnay-sur-Seine and 0.062 ± 0.001 at Méry-sur-Marne. These low Tl 282 concentrations measured at upstream sites of the Seine River basin cannot be explained by a dilution effect. It is more reasonable to attribute these low concentrations to the sedimentary 283 origin of the rocks in the Seine River basin. Moreover, the Tl concentration observed at 284 285 Marnay-sur-Seine lower than the Tl concentration at Méry-sur-Marne may be partly explained by a possible metal release from the suspended sediments trapped during one month periods 286 287 at Marnay-sur-Seine.

288

289 **Depth profiles of Ag and Tl concentrations**

290 Sc, Ag and Tl concentrations measured along the sediment profiles of the B2 and M1 291 cores as well as the estimated chronology of deposition are shown in Tables 3 and 4.

The Ag concentration showed strong variations along the profile of the B2 core (from 4 to 25 mg kg⁻¹) (Table 3). The highest concentration (24.6 mg kg⁻¹) was recorded in 1960. The lowest concentration (3.8 mg kg⁻¹) was measured in the uppermost superficial layer which corresponds to the sediment deposited in 2003. Moreover, the peaks in Ag concentrations (observed in 1960 and, to a lesser extent, in 1994) correspond to similar peaks in Zn, Sb, Hg and Pb concentrations 21 . The 1960 peak probably reflects the industrial boom after the Second World War.

The depth profile of Ag concentration in the M1 core is similar to the one obtained in the other core, even though it is systematically characterised by slightly lower concentrations (Table 4). Similar observations can be made for Sc concentrations. This indicates the presence of a less abundant clay fraction in M1 compared to B2.

303 To document the influence of anthropogenic activities, temporal variations of the Ag 304 and Tl enrichment factors (EF) ratios were calculated, taking account of the upper continental 305 crust (UCC) concentrations as a reference (Table 5). The following EF values should be 306 interpreted with some caution, keeping in mind the shortcomings of the EF approach, EF being calculated relative to the crust composition or to local background values ³⁰. Ag EF 307 308 recorded in both B2 and M1 cores were extremely high. EF in Ag ranged between 51 and 300 309 in B2 and between 73 and 263 in M1, when using UCC concentrations as reference values. 310 After normalising Ag concentrations to Sc, the Ag EF depth profiles were much more similar 311 in both cores (Fig. 3). Ag EF obtained taking the concentrations measured at Marnay-sur-312 Seine as a reference ranged from 8 to 47 in the B2 core and from 12 to 39 in the M1 core.

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

When using the concentrations at Méry-sur-Marne, Ag EF fluctuated similarly between 12 and 44 in the B2 core, and 12 and 26 in the M1 core. These results demonstrate a significant enrichment of sediment in Ag and Tl during its transfer from the upper catchment sites to the downstream sites. This enrichment is clearly associated with contemporary anthropogenic impacts, whereas the enrichment observed at the upstream sites was probably induced by more ancient human activities.

Given it is widely known that Pb-ores constitute an important Ag source 31 , it is 319 particularly relevant to compare the Ag concentrations with the ones obtained for Pb²¹. Both 320 321 profiles were found to be synchronous (results not shown). Examination of the Pb/Ag ratio can provide valuable insights about the dominant emission processes ¹¹. The Pb/Ag ratio 322 323 decreased from ca. 50 in sediment deposited in 1930, up to 20 in the 2003 sediment. The higher enrichment in Pb than in Ag observed in the Swiss peat bog ¹¹ level corresponding to 324 325 1967 is not observed in the Seine River sediment. In addition, the Pb/Ag ratios observed in the Seine sediment cores are significantly lower than those observed in peat bog ¹¹ and even 326 lower than the Pb/Ag ratio reported in UCC (i.e. 400^{3}). Overall, we can confidently state that 327 328 the Seine River sediment is enriched in Ag compared to Pb.

Tl concentrations in the B2 core ranged between 0.66 and 1.01 mg kg⁻¹, with a median 329 concentration of 0.86 ± 0.12 mg kg⁻¹ all throughout the depth profile. No significant peak can 330 331 be detected in the profile (Table 3). The lowest Tl concentration in sediment was measured in 332 the sediment deposited in 1979. Furthermore, Tl EF mean values were close to 1 (0.9 in average) (Table 5) when taking the UCC concentrations as a reference, indicating an absence 333 334 of enrichment. TI EF calculated using concentrations measured at Marnay-sur-Seine and 335 Méry-sur-Marne reached 2.1 and 1.5, respectively. The low but constant enrichment in Tl measured in the downstream sediment suggests the potential existence of a natural Tl source 336 337 in the Seine River basin. We suspect that the Yonne river sediment could be responsible for

this Seine sediment enrichment in Tl. The Yonne river flows indeed into the Seine River at a

339 junction located downstream of Marnay-sur-Seine (Fig. 1a), after having flown across

340 granites exposed in the Morvan region. Granites are known to be enriched in Tl 7 .

341

342 Thallium pollution records in the sediment cores

343 Atmospheric archives are characterised by an important Tl pollution, which is even more important than Ag pollution ^{11,12,13}. Our results clearly point out that the increase in Tl 344 345 atmospheric source(s) measured in atmospheric archives did not impact the composition of 346 the Seine River sediment. The geochemical behaviour of Tl is similar to the one of potassium and other alkali metal cations 31,32 . The lability of Tl may bring into question the relevance of 347 348 a sediment core to record a Tl pollution signal. However, this issue remains the object of a lively debate in the literature. On the one hand, mobilisation of Tl from the solid phase to pore 349 waters was observed in lacustrine sediment cores ^{12,33}. Laforte et al. (2005)³³ concluded that 350 351 the significant post-depositional Tl mobility must be taken into account to interpret Tl profiles 352 in sediment. On the other hand, it was also shown that TI sorbed strongly on layered illitic and vermiculite clays ¹⁹. Moreover, no Tl desorption was observed from clay-rich soils when 353 adding NH_4^+ and K^+ competitive cations. This even considered to be enough stable to allow 354 its chronological evaluation ³⁴. The strong sorption of Tl from atmospheric origin on silty and 355 silty-clay soils of France was demonstrated ³². It was also showed that Tl present in the 356 357 French soils had a pedological origin.

358 Consequently, it seems reasonable to conclude that, if a significant Tl contamination 359 had affected the Seine River basin, it would have been recorded, at least partly, in the river 360 sediment. Given the absence of any pollution signal in the B2 and M1 sediment cores, we can 361 conclude to the absence of any significant Tl contamination in the Seine River sediment 362 between the 1940s and today. Page 21 of 65

Journal of Environmental Monitoring - For Review Only

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

The need to further investigate the partitioning of Tl between the solid and dissolved phases in soils was outlined ¹⁹. Future investigations could also usefully determine Tl partitioning between the sediment and the dissolved phase in rivers. Solid/dissolved partitioning of Tl is of primary importance because of the high toxicity of soluble Tl compounds. Moreover, obtaining this value would allow calculating the dissolved fluxes based on the particulate fluxes which are much easier to measure.

369

370 **Potential sources of Ag to the river**

Ag may be released by different sources to the environment. Thouvenin et al. $(2005)^{18}$ 371 estimated the silver contribution of the Seine River to its estuary in 2003. Sediments were 372 monthly sampled in Poses, which is the last dam before the estuary. In 2003, the Ag flux in 373 Poses was estimated at 1.5 t yr⁻¹¹⁸. Based on the measurements obtained from the B2 374 375 sediment core sampled in 2003 at Bouafles, which is located 30 km upstream of Poses, we can propose a rough and comparative estimation of the Ag annual flux. The particulate output 376 of the Seine was estimated at 450,000 t yr⁻¹ in 2003¹⁸. Ag concentration in the uppermost 377 layers of the B2 core reached 3.8 mg kg⁻¹, we can then estimate the particulate Ag output 378 from the Seine River at 1.7 t yr⁻¹. Similar calculations applied to the M1 uppermost layer 379 concentration result in an Ag particulate flux of 2.0 t yr⁻¹. Both estimations remain in good 380 agreement with the ones obtained previously ¹⁸, given that the concentrations in the 381 382 uppermost layer of the core are only representative of the solids concentration reached during periods of high water level. Moreover, suspended sediment ¹⁸ and deposited sediment (this 383 384 work) differ in terms of particle size and organic matter content. Still, these characteristics 385 influence the metal concentration in sediment. Overall, our results suggest that the Ag export to the Seine River estuary $(1.7 - 2.0 \text{ t yr}^{-1})$ is at least equivalent to the cadmium and mercury 386 fluxes at the river mouth (1.75 and 1.25 t yr^{-1} , respectively ²⁷). Given the high toxicity of Ag, 387

388 Ag concentrations in the solid and the dissolved phases should be monitored to evaluate 389 precisely the Ag particulate and dissolved fluxes from the river and to allow conducting 390 further risk assessment studies.

It is necessary to determine the potential sources delivering Ag to the river in order to 391 392 propose potential remediation regulations. Metal mining and smelting activities are known to 393 constitute the major Ag contaminating sources to atmospheric and aquatic environments. 394 However, there is no sulphide ore exploitation in the Seine River basin. In contrast, municipal 395 waste incinerators could be an important source of Ag contamination in the Seine River. They 396 incinerate domestic waste as well as electronic devices that were not sorted out for recycling. In the Seine River basin, more than 70% of the solid wastes are incinerated. 36% of discarded 397 (not recycled) Ag in Europe are found in municipal solid wastes ⁵. During the incineration 398 process, silver ends up as bottom and fly ashes, and emissions to the atmosphere remain 399 therefore limited ¹⁷. Solid wastes issued from municipal waste incinerators contain the bulk of 400 anthropogenic Ag ⁵. Sewage sludge constitutes the second Ag source. Landfilling of solid 401 402 wastes issued from thermal treatment incinerators and sewage sludge might constitute a 403 delayed risk of Ag contamination if landfill contaminants were released to the environment by 404 soil erosion.

405 Forty-five percents of the silver used in the film and photo production were not recycled and potentially exposed to the environment in 1997⁵. The film photography first 406 developed at the end of the 19th century and became a mass-consumption product throughout 407 408 the 20th century. This use may have induced a large part of the ancient sediment 409 contamination, not only because of the lack of restrictive waste management regulations, but 410 also because of the spreading of numerous photo laboratories. The exponentially decreasing 411 demand for this use could explain the decrease in Ag concentration measured in the 412 contemporary sediment.

Silver and thallium historical trends in an urban catchment

413 Ag content in domestic waste is likely to increase again in future. A recent study 414 carried out in the Rhine river catchment showed that the production of goods using Ag 415 nanoparticles will increase in future. This will amplify the Ag release to freshwater environments ¹⁷. These products consist in plastics (medical catheters, sanitation tubes, 416 417 computer keyboards, door handles, car steering wheels and mobile phones) and textiles 418 benefiting from the biocide effect of Ag nanoparticles. The biocidal mechanism of silver-419 containing products results indeed from a long term release of silver ions (Ag⁺) by oxidation of metallic silver (Ag⁰) in contact with aqueous media. Up to 15% of the total silver emitted 420 to water in Europe may be released from biocidal plastics and textiles in 2010 17 . 421

422

423 **Conclusions**

424 Very few records were available to document the contamination by metals of minor 425 economic importance such as Ag and Tl in river catchments strongly modified by human 426 activities. These metals prove nevertheless to be very toxic. This study demonstrated that the 427 Seine River sediment was not contaminated by Tl during the last 60 years. However, the 428 question of its partition between the solid and the dissolved phases remains a subject of lively 429 debate. In contrast, the Seine River sediment was severely contaminated by Ag. 430 Concentration in this metal started decreasing in the 1960s, but it is still present in the 431 environment. Nowadays, the main source of Ag to the river sediment appears to originate 432 from the waste incinerators. However, the sources of Ag may have changed throughout the 433 last decades. Moreover, the increasing Ag demand and the growth of its uses demonstrate the 434 necessity to understand the biogeochemical cycle of Ag, which can partly be investigated 435 through the analysis of environmental archives.

436

437 **Aknowledgements**

- 438 We thank G. Varrault, B. Pernet-Coudrier and A. Bourgeault for their help for the collection
- 439 of suspended sediment. M.-F. Le Cloarec and J.-M. Mouchel are thanked for their active
- 440 participation to the sediment core collection and analysis. This work has been made possible
- 441 thanks to funding from the Piren-Seine programme, the French National Research Agency
- 442 (ANR) Biomet project and the EC2CO Medisis project. This is the LSCE contribution
- 443 number 4097.
- 444
- 445

446 **References**

447		
448	1	J. O. Nriagu, <i>Science</i> , 1996, 272 , 223-224.
449	2	R. P. Schwarzenbach, B. I. Escher, K. Fenner, T. B. Hofstetter, A. Johnson, U. von
450		Gunten and B. Wehrli, <i>Science</i> , 2006, 313 , 1072-1077.
451	3	S. R. Taylor and S. M. McLennan, The Continental Crust: Its Composition and Evolution,
452		Blackwell Scientific, Oxford, 1985, 328 pp.
453	4	H. T. Ratte, Environ. Toxicol. Chem., 1999, 18, 89-108.
454	5	T. Lanzano, M. Bertram, M. De Palo, C. Wagner, K. Zyla and T. E. Graedel, Resources,
455		Conservation and Recycling, 2006, 46, 27-43.
456	6	World Silver Survey, The Silver Institute and Gold Fields Mineral Services, Ltd.,
457		Washington, DC, 2009.
458	7	C. Reimann and P. De Caritat, Chemical Elements in the Environment. Factsheets for the
459		Geochemist and Environmental Scientist, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York, London, Paris,
460		Tokyo, Hong Kong: Springer-Verlag, 1999, 398 pp.
461	8	M. J. Eckelman and T. E. Graedel, Environ. Sci. Technol., 2007, 41, 6283-6289
462	9	J. O. Nriagu and J. M. Pacyna Environ. Rev., 1988, 9, 269-298.
463	10	K. Van de Velde, C. Barbante, G. Cozzi, I. Moret, T. Bellomi, C. Ferrari and C. Boutron,
464		Atmos. Environ., 2000, 34, 3117-3127.
465	11	W. Shotyk and M. Krachler, J. Environ. Monit., 2004, 6, 427-433.
466	12	E. Grahn, S. Karlsson, U. Karlsson and A. Düker, J. Environ. Monit., 2006, 8, 732-744.
467	13	M. Krachler, J. Zheng, D. Fisher and W. Shotyk, Sci. Total Environ., 2008, 399, 78 – 89.
468	14	A. R. Flegal and C. C. Patterson, Marine Chemistry, 1985, 15, 327-331.
469	15	T. S. Lin, J. Nriagu and X. Q. Wang, Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol., 2001, 67, 921-925.
470	16	V. Cappuyns and V.Swennen, J. Environ. Monitor., 2004, 6, 434-440.
471	17	S. A. Blaser, M. Scheringer, M. MacLeod and K. Hungerbühler, Sci. Total Environ.,
472		2008, 390 , 396-409.
473	18	B. Thouvenin, B. Boutier, JF. Chiffoleau, JL. Gonzalez., D. Cossa, D. Auger, B.
474		Averty, E. Rozuel-Chartier, D. Ménard, A. Santini and M. Olivier, Contribution à l'étude
475		de la dynamique et de la spéciation des contaminants, Rapport d'activité 2004.
476		Programme Seine Aval 3 (see also http://seine-aval.crihan.fr/web), 2005, 46 pp.
477	19	A R.Jacobson, M. B.McBride, P. Baveye and T. S. Steenhuis, Sci. Total Environ., 2005,
478		345 , 191-205.

- 479 20 M. Meybeck, L. Lestel, P. Bonté, R. Moilleron, J.-L. Colin, O. Rousselot, D. Hervé, C. de
 480 Pontevès, C. Grosbois and D. R. Thévenot, *Sci. Total Environ.*, 2007, **375** (1-3), 204-231.
- 481 21 M.-F. Le Cloarec, P. Bonté, L. Lestel, I. Lefèvre and S. Ayrault, *Physics & Chemistry of*482 *the Earth.* in press
- 483 22 K. Wang and R. J. Cornett, *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 1993, **9**, 179-188.
- 484 23 C. Gil-García, A. Rigol and M. Vidal, J. Environ. Radioact., 2009, 100, 690-696.
- 485 24 P. Bonté, J.-M. Mouchel, A. Thomas, M.-F. Le Cloarec, J-P. Dumoulin, S. Sogon and L.
 486 Tessier, *Acta Geol. Hisp.*, 2000, **35**, 339–355.
- 487 25 L. Tessier, Transport et caractérisation des matières en suspension dans le bassin de la
- 488 Seine : identification de signatures naturelles et anthropiques, Ph. D. thesis, Ecole
 489 Nationale des Ponts et Chaussée, France, 2003, 344 pp.
- 490 26 K. H. Wedepohl, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 1985, **59**, 1217-1232.
- 491 27 D. R. Thévenot, R. Moilleron, L. Lestel, M.-C. Gromaire, V. Rocher, P. Cambier, P.
- 492 Bonté, J.-L. Colin, C. de Pontevès and M. Meybeck, *Sci. Total Environ.*, 2007, **375** (1–3),
 493 180–203.
- 494 28 IREP, *Registre Français des Émissions Polluantes* [*French Register on Contaminant* 495 *Emissions*]. French Ministry of Ecology, Energy, Sustainable Development and Marine
- 496 Affairs, Paris. (see also <u>http://www.pollutionsindustrielles.ecologie.gouv.fr</u>
- 497 /IREP/index.php), 2009
- 498 29 R. Salminen, Geochemical Atlas of Europe. Part 1 Background Information,
- 499 *Methodology and Maps.* Forum of European Geological Surveys (FOREGS), G.S. of
- 500 Finland, Espoo (Also available at <u>www.gsf.fi/publ/foregsatlas/index.php</u>), 2005.
- 501 30 C. Reimann and P. De Caritat, *Sci. Total Environ.*, 2005, **337**, 91-107.
- 502 31 D. C. Adriano, Trace elements in terrestrial environments: biogeochemistry,
- 503 *bioavailability, and risks of metals*, 2nd ed. Springer-Verlag, New York, 2001, 867 pp.
- 32 A. Tremel, P. Masson, T. Sterckeman, D. Baize and M. Mench M., *Environ. Poll.*, 1997,
 95 (3), 293-302.
- 506 33 L. Laforte, A. Tessier, C. Gobeil and R. Carignan. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 2005, 69
 507 (22), 5295-5306.
- 508 34 Y. Gélinas, M. Lucotte and J.-P. Schmit, Atmos. Environ., 2000, 34, 1797-1810.
- 509
- 510
- 511
- 512 513

Table 1 Analytical information. Instrumental detection limits (including digestion blanks for
 ICP-MS; mg kg⁻¹). Analysis of certified material GXR-1 (USGS). INAA: Instrumental
 Neutron Activation Analysis. ICP-MS: Inductively Coupled Plasma – Mass Spectrometry.

	Quantification li	mits	Reference material					
	INAA ICP-MS		Certified value	Measured value INAA (n=3)	Measured value ICP-MS (n=3)			
	mg kg⁻¹	mg kg⁻¹	mg kg⁻¹	mg kg⁻¹	mg kg⁻¹			
Sc	0.1	n.d.	1.58±0.20	1.7±0.1	n.d.			
Ag	1	0.005	31±4	33±3	31±3			
ΤI	n.d.	0.001	0.39±0.20 ^a	n.d.	0.40±0.02			
$(a) \Gamma$	marriatanal agena	manation realized	, m d m of dotomine	4				

529 (a) Provisional concentration value; n.d. not determined

Table 2 Scandium (Sc), silver (Ag) and thallium (Tl) geochemical background values in the
upper continental crust (literature) and in suspended sediment collected at upstream stations
of the Seine River basin (mg kg⁻¹).

		Sc			Ag		TI	
Upper continental crust								
Taylor and McLenr	nan (1985)	11			0.050		0.75	
Wedepohl (1995)	7			0.055		0.75		
Local background station								
Marnay-sur-Seine	Dec 08	6.6 ^a	±	0.1	0.24 ^b ±	0.01	0.32 ^b ±	0.02
	Jan 09	6.6 ^a	±	0.1	0.25 ^b ±	0.01	0.31 ^b ±	0.02
	Feb 09	6.7 ^a	±	0.1	0.50 ^b ±	0.02	0.27 ^b ±	0.01
Méry-sur-Marne	Apr 06	7.0 ^a	±	0.1	0.59 ^b ±	0.03	0.43 ^b ±	0.02
	Jan 07	7.6 ^a	±	0.1	0.59 ^b ±	0.03	0.48 ^b ±	0.02

542 (a) INAA determinations

543 (b) ICP-MS determinations

Table 3 Scandium (Sc), silver (Ag) and thallium (Tl) concentrations values in the B2 core $(mg kg^{-1})$. (n.d. not determined)

Voor	50			٨٥					
Tear	30			Ay			11		
2003	9.5	±	0.8	3.8	±	0.4	n.d.		
1997	7.2	±	0.6	7.9	±	0.8	0.70	±	0.04
1994	8.0	±	0.6	13.1	±	1.3	0.95	±	0.05
1989	9.3	±	0.7	10.7	±	1.1	0.92	±	0.05
1986	10.3	±	0.8	7.4	±	0.7	n.d.		
1985	9.8	±	0.8	9.2	±	0.9	0.84	±	0.04
1983	9.6	±	0.8	10.5	±	1.0	0.87	±	0.04
1979	9.5	±	0.8	11.3	±	1.1	0.66	±	0.03
1974	9.1	±	0.7	15.5	±	1.5	0.77	±	0.04
1967	9.6	±	0.8	22.4	±	2.2	0.97	±	0.05
1963	10.5	±	0.8	24.6	±	2.5	0.80	±	0.04
1960	9.7	±	0.8	20.8	±	2.1	1.01	±	0.05
1956	10.1	±	0.8	20.4	±	2.0	n.d.		
1949	9.0	±	0.7	8.8	±	0.9	n.d.		
1943	9.2	±	0.7	9.9	±	1.0	0.99	±	0.05

Table 4 Scandium (Sc) and silver (Ag) concentrations values in the M1 core (mg kg⁻¹) (n.d. not determined).

Year	Sc			Ag			Tl		
2002	7.7	±	0.6	4.4	±	0.4	0.54	±	0.03
1995	6.0	±	0.5	4.6	±	0.5	0.50	±	0.03
1988	6.9	±	0.6	6.1	\pm	0.6	0.56	\pm	0.03
1986	6.7	±	0.5	6.1	\pm	0.6	n.d.		
1983	5.7	±	0.5	6.8	\pm	0.7	0.49	\pm	0.02
1980	5.7	±	0.5	6.7	\pm	0.7	n.d.		
1970	6.9	±	0.6	14.3	\pm	1.4	0.64	\pm	0.03
1968	6.4	±	0.5	11.9	\pm	1.2	0.49	\pm	0.02
1961	8.0	±	0.6	13.6	\pm	1.4	0.64	\pm	0.03
1957	8.9	±	0.7	8.7	\pm	0.9	0.68	\pm	0.03
1951	7.4	±	0.6	4.7	\pm	0.5	n.d.		
1943	9.0	±	0.7	9.6	\pm	1.0	1.36	\pm	0.07
1936	8.6	±	0.7	9.1	\pm	0.9	n.d.		
1933	7.5	<u>±</u>	0.6	6.2	\pm	0.6	0.67	\pm	0.03

562	Table 5 Silver (Ag) and thallium (Tl) enrichment factors in the B2 and M1 cores, and in the
563	upstream sites. Ref: upper continental crust reference concentrations used for the calculation

564 of enrichment factors (Wedepohl, 1995). See text for details.

B2 core			M1 core		
Year	Ag	Tl	Year	Ag	Tl
2003	51		2002	73	0.65
1997	140	0.91	1995	98	0.78
1994	208	1.11	1988	112	0.76
1989	146	0.93	1986	116	
1986	92		1983	152	0.79
1985	119	0.79	1980	151	
1983	139	0.84	1970	263	0.86
1979	153	0.65	1968	235	0.71
1974	217	0.79	1961	217	0.75
1967	296	0.94	1957	124	0.72
1963	300	0.72	1951	81	
1960	272	0.97	1943	136	1.41
1956	256		1936	135	
1949	124		1933	105	0.84
1943	137	1.01			
		0.45			
Marnay (Dec 08)	4.6	0.45			
Marnay (Jan 09)	4.9	0.45			
Marnay (Feb 09)	9.5	0.37			
Méry (Apr 06)	10.7	0.57			
Méry (Jan 07)	9.9	0.59			
1					
$Ref(mg kg^{-1})$	0.055	0.75		0.055	0.75

Figure 1 (a) Location of the B2 and M1 sediment cores and the suspended sediment sampling
sites (Marnay-sur-Seine and Méry-sur-Marne) in the Seine River basin. (b) Location of the
currently operational Pb industries in the upstream part of the Seine catchment and in the
Marne catchment (Source: IREP, 2009).

- 576 (a)





Figure 2 Depth profiles of the Cs-137 activity. (a) (\blacktriangle) B2 core (Bouafles); (b) (\bullet) M1 core (Muids). (a) The chronology derived from the measured activities is indicated on the right axis of the graph for the B2 core. (c) Due to changes in the deposition rate along the depth profile of the M1 core, its chronological profile is shown in a separated graph.

599

600





Figure 3 Enrichment factor (EF) in Ag in the depth profiles of the two analysed cores: (\blacktriangle)

B2 core (Bouafles); (•) M1 core (Muids) using upper continental crust values as reference.
605

606



610 611

607 608 609

- 612
- 613 614



616 This manuscript reports the temporal evolution of silver (Ag) and thallium (Tl) concentrations 617 in sediment cores. These cores, issued from downstream Seine River flood plains, represent extraordinary archives of the sediments flowing across Paris conurbation. Ag and Tl are two 618 619 toxic metals, released to the environment by human activities and scarcely documented in 620 river sediment. The present work shows a huge Ag sediment contamination around 1960. In 621 contrast, no contamination was registered for Tl. These findings increase the understanding of Ag and Tl environmental cycles in urban environments. In addition, the Ag and Tl 622 623 geochemical background concentrations in the Seine River were documented. Ag 624 concentrations were tenfold higher than the Ag background values reported for the upper continental crust. This emphasizes the need to increase the research efforts on silver and 625

- 626 thallium that have been understudied in an environmental context, whereas the uses of Ag are
- 627 dramatically increasing.



Environmental archives showed that the Seine River (France) was severely contaminated by silver during the last century.